



When the walls close in: Comparative analysis of three cities during siege

Dr. Shivam Bahuguna

Hamdard Institute of International Studies Jamia Hamdard, New Delhi, India

DOI:

Abstract

Throughout urban history, cities have functioned as intricate social, political, and spatial systems. Cities have evolved over history, transforming from early riverine settlements into complex, multi-scalar socio-spatial networks characterized by interdependent flows of humans, goods, capital, and information. Classic and contemporary urban theory predominantly conceptualizes the city through ideas of connectivity, spatial mobility, external aggregation, and continuous metabolic accumulation. This article deviates from the established paradigms by examining cities as a system through the catastrophe of the military siege. The deliberate severance of core infrastructural and metabolic conduits disrupts the functional anatomy of the urban fabric. This study utilises first-person ego-documents as socio-historical diagnostic tools across three historical ruptures, namely, Henry Labouchere's account of the Siege of Paris (1870–1871), Robert Coltman Jr.'s documentation of the Siege of the Peking Legations (1900–1901), and Cynthia Simmons and Nina Perlina's compilation of survivor testimonies from the Siege of Leningrad (1941–1944) in order to establish a comparative thematic framework. The study analyses (1) the structural mechanics of spatial disconnection, (2) the highly stratified internal redistribution of systemic burdens and psychological strains across socio-economic, spatial, and gender lines, and (3) the siege as a critical institutional juncture that catalyses permanent political, spatial, and socio-governmental realignments. The paper argues that a siege strips away the fetishized exterior of urban modernity to expose the underlying ontology of the city, proving that urban viability does not merely rely on static physical walls or architecture. Rather, cities persist on the continuous, vulnerable choreography of urban life and its flows.

Keywords: Urban systems theory, socio-metabolic rupture, siege warfare, ego-documents, comparative urban history

Introduction

In the long arc of human civilization, urban nodes first coalesced along major riverine systems, most notably the Nile, the Tigris, the Euphrates, and the Indus. These acted as concentrated spatial foci for agricultural surplus, ecological transformation, and centralized administrative authority (Childe, 1950; Wheatley, 1971) ^[9, 52]. From these early riverine agglomerations, urban formations have progressively evolved into vast, highly integrated spatial networks that possess a dynamic, self-reinforcing momentum. The seminal urbanist Jane Jacobs conceptualized the living city as an "intricate ballet in which the individual dancers and ensembles all have distinctive parts which miraculously reinforce each other and compose an orderly whole" (Jacobs, 1961 ^[32], p. 50). Modern urban theory expands upon this foundational insight, going beyond cities as collections of isolated physical artifacts. Rather, cities are dynamic systems embedded within wider regional, national, and global networks of exchange (Batty, 2007; Castells, 1996) ^[3, 8]. Historically, urban centres have fulfilled multi-dimensional socioeconomic and political imperatives. They function simultaneously as political capitals, industrial manufacturing centres, financial clearinghouses, confluence nodes of major trade routes, sacred spaces of pilgrimage, and centres of technological and educational innovation (Weber, 1958; Mumford, 1961) ^[41, 51]. Because of this structural versatility and functional density, the value, strategic meaning, and vulnerability of a city undergo a fundamental metamorphosis during total war. Within military strategy, cities are concurrently viewed as defensive fortifications, high-value geopolitical prizes, symbolic

bastions of sovereign state power, and prime targets for violent subjugation (Graham, 2004; Coward, 2009) ^[14, 25]. When armed conflict shifts from rural battlefields, open plains, and defensive trenches to converge upon the urban threshold, it frequently manifests as a siege.

The urban siege represents the quintessential operationalization of systemic warfare. Rather than relying solely on direct kinetic destruction to collapse an enemy force, a siege operates through total environmental and spatial enclosure. It is a calculated strategy designed to sever the city's essential metabolic inflows such as its vital conduits of food, potable water, energy, communication, and human reinforcement. Siege forces the urban organism to feed upon its internal reserves until systemic entropy ensues (Shaw, 2005; Elden, 2013) ^[17, 45]. While military historians have extensively catalogued the tactical and operational dimensions of sieges, urban studies and political science have less frequently interrogated what the siege reveals about the fundamental ontology of the city as a complex system. To address this research gap, this article examines three major historical sieges spanning different geographical settings, political regimes, and historical epochs: (1) the Prussian Siege of Paris during the Franco-Prussian War (1870–1871) ^[10, 38], (2) the Boxer Siege of the Foreign Legations in Peking (1900–1901) ^[13, 26], and (3) the Nazi and Finnish Blockade of Leningrad during the Second World War (1941 ^[2]–1944). Grounded in the socio-historical analysis of primary first-person accounts, or *ego-documents* (Dekker, 2002; Fulbrook & Rublack, 2010) ^[16, 21] this study investigates how extreme spatial isolation and metabolic interdiction fracture the structural, social, and institutional anatomy of the urban system.

Conceptual Framework and Methodological Foundations

1. Urban Systems Theory, Urban Political Ecology, and the Concept of Metabolic Rupture

To analyse the city under siege as a systemic phenomenon, this article integrates insights from urban systems theory (Batty, 2007; Bettencourt, 2013) ^[3, 4] and urban political ecology (Gandy, 2002; Swyngedouw, 2006; Heynen *et al.*, 2006) ^[22, 30]. Systems theory posits that cities are non-linear, self-organizing networks characterized by complex feedback loops, modular sub-assemblies, and high degrees of functional interdependence. A city cannot survive in spatial isolation; its persistence depends upon continuous inputs of raw materials, energy, and information, alongside the continuous output and processing of metabolic waste products (Wolman, 1965; Kennedy *et al.*, 2007) ^[34, 53]. Building upon this systemic framing, urban political ecology (UPE) utilizes the metaphor of *urban metabolism*. Herein, flows such as water networks, agricultural supply chains, energy grids, and transportation lines emphasize that the biophysical flows supporting urban life are deeply intertwined with social relations, state power, and class dynamics (Swyngedouw, 1996; Kaika, 2005) ^[33, 48]. The city is understood as a socio-natural hybrid, a socio-metabolic process where physical matter is continually transformed into urban infrastructure and social vitality.

When an invading army subjects a city to a blockade, it executes a deliberate, hostile enforcement of metabolic rupture (Foster, 1999; Moore, 2015) ^[20, 40]. Borrowing and adapting Karl Marx's concept of the "metabolic rift", which originally described the spatial alienation of agricultural nutrient cycles caused by rapid capitalist urbanization, we provisionally define *metabolic rupture in siege warfare* as the sudden, violent termination of the metabolic inputs and infrastructural flows necessary to sustain human biology and urban order. Under conditions of metabolic rupture, the open urban system is forcibly converted into a closed, entropic container. The collapse of external inputs triggers cascading structural failures across every urban subsystem, including municipal governance, public health, market pricing, social cohesion, and the built environment.

2. Critical Junctures and Historical Institutionalism

To understand the long-term historical impact of sieges, this study also draws upon historical institutionalism, specifically the concept of critical junctures (Collier & Collier, 1991; Mahoney & Thelen, 2010) ^[12, 37]. Critical junctures are brief periods of intense institutional fluidity or crisis during which normal structural constraints are loosened, allowing strategic decisions, social upheavals, and operational adaptations to send political and urban systems along new, highly path-dependent historical trajectories. A siege acts as an extraordinary critical juncture: by applying extreme structural pressure to a city's political and social institutions, it forces radical reorganizations of municipal authority, property relations, class power, and ideological identities that frequently persist long after the siege is lifted.

3. Methodology: Comparative Analysis of Ego-Documents

To capture both the macro-systemic disruptions and the micro-sociological realities of urban collapse, this study utilizes a qualitative, comparative historical methodology anchored in the textual analysis of primary ego-documents

(Dekker, 2002; Fullbrook & Rublack, 2010) ^[16, 21]. Ego-documents—comprising diaries, personal letters, written memoirs, and recorded oral testimonies—provide uniquely detailed diagnostic evidence regarding how individuals experience, interpret, and navigate systemic collapse in real time.

Rather than relying strictly on top-down administrative state archives or post-hoc military histories, ego-documents allow researchers to examine the lived experience of metabolic rupture, capturing the informal survival strategies, psychological realignments, and shifting perceptions of urban space that official statistics frequently obscure.

This study analyses three primary sets of ego-documents

1. **The Siege of Paris (1870–1871)** ^[1, 10]: Primary evidence is drawn from *Diary of the Besieged Resident in Paris*, written by the British politician and journalist Henry Labouchere (1871) ^[36]. Labouchere was trapped in Paris during the four-month Prussian encirclement amidst the Franco-Prussian War. His letters, dispatched via hot-air balloons to *The Daily News* in London, offer an analytical, sardonic, and socio-politically detailed account of urban decay, class dynamics, and municipal governance under siege.
2. **The Siege of Peking (1900–1901)** ^[13, 26]: Primary evidence is derived from *Beleaguered in Peking: The Boxers' Siege between the Legations*, authored by Dr. Robert Coltman Jr. (1901) ^[13], an American physician stationed in China. Coltman's first-hand narrative documents the 55-day entrapment of foreign diplomats, military personnel, and native Chinese Christian refugees inside the fortified Legations Quarter during the anti-imperialist Boxer Uprising (*Yihetuan Movement*).
3. **The Siege of Leningrad (1941 ^[6]–1944)**: Primary evidence is sourced from *Writing the Siege of Leningrad: Historical Narratives, Oral Histories, and Diaries*, edited and translated by Cynthia Simmons and Nina Perlina (2005) ^[46]. This compilation gathers diaries, letters, personal notes, and oral interviews from the surviving women known as the *blokadnitsy*. Leningrad residents endured the nearly 900-day lethal blockade imposed by Nazi Germany's Wehrmacht and Finnish forces during Operation Barbarossa.

To systematically compare these distinct historical cases, the analysis is structured around three overarching thematic axes:

- **Theme 1: Disconnection and Metabolic Rupture** – Examining the physical, spatial, and temporal mechanics of isolation; the immediate collapse of urban-hinterland resource dependencies; and the breakdown of urban communication networks.
- **Theme 2: Burdens of Siege: Scarcity, Class Stratification, and Psychological Endurance** – Analysing the differential distribution of deprivation across socio-economic classes, age cohorts, and genders; the radical shift in the semiotics of food and survival; and the emergence of the "burden of pretence" as a psychological coping mechanism.

- **Theme 3: Permanent Structural Transformations and Institutional Legacies** – Evaluating how sieges function as critical junctures that permanently alter the ideological, administrative, and spatial landscapes of the city and its broader nation-state.

Disconnection and Metabolic Rupture

1. The Dissonance of Encirclement and the Rupture of Daily Rhythms

In the initial stages of a military siege, the onset of spatial isolation rarely manifests as an instantaneous structural collapse. Instead, it begins with a surreal phase of socio-spatial dissonance: the daily rhythms of modern urban life persist in tandem with a growing, anxious realization that the city's metabolic lifelines have been compromised.

In Henry Labouchere's chronicle of Paris in September 1870^[10], the narrative opens amidst the bustling public celebrations of a national *fête day*. To a casual observer, the boulevard culture of Haussmannized Paris appeared intact, even as 300,000 Prussian soldiers systematically surrounded the outer ring of fortifications (Labouchere, 1871^[36]; Merriman, 2014). Yet beneath this public performance of normality lay an escalating paranoia. Labouchere describes how civilian mobs roamed the streets, seizing upon individuals suspected of being Prussian spies or disguised *Uhlans*—the light cavalry units that epitomized the encroaching enemy (Labouchere, 1871; Bradford, 2004)^[7, 36]. The visible presence of the regular army, the *Mobiles*, and the civilian *Garde Nationale* rapidly altered the spatial atmosphere of the city, transforming romantic parks and public squares into military encampments and parade grounds.

In Peking, Dr. Robert Coltman Jr.'s account illustrates a similar period of mounting infrastructural and spatial friction preceding total encirclement. The narrative records escalating anti-foreign riots, localized attacks on missionary outposts, and violent skirmishes along key transportation corridors, such as the strategic railway links connecting Peking to Tianjin and the historical flashpoints near the Marco Polo Bridge (Coltman, 1901^[13]; Harrington, 2001). As the *Yihetuan* (Boxer) fighters gained official sanction from Empress Dowager Cixi and the Qing imperial court, the foreign expatriate community witnessed the progressive closure of the city gates, the cutting of telegraph wires, and the burning of outlying mission compounds. The urban space of Peking fragmented into hostile, hyper-politicized sectors before collapsing into a concentrated 55-day siege within the diplomatic quarter.

For Leningrad, the entry into siege conditions occurred under the terrifying shadow of total, exterminatory warfare following Nazi Germany's invasion of the Soviet Union in June 1941^[2] (Glantz, 2001; Reid, 2011). Because the population was already mobilised for war, the onset of the blockade was marked by a steady, agonizing reduction in metabolic inputs rather than sudden surprise. In the autobiographical account "Sweet Earth," recorded by Liudmila Ivanovna Veshenkova in the Simmons and Perlina compilation, this transition is remembered through the intimate domestic sphere: her mother returned home later and later each night through air-raid sirens, carrying progressively diminished portions of food to feed her child (Simmons & Perlina, 2005)^[46]. Veshenkova's recollection serves as a poignant micro-level record of the macro-

metabolic rupture that would ultimately claim over one million civilian lives through state-engineered starvation.

2. The Collapse of Urban-Hinterland Asymmetries

A critical insight generated by urban political ecology is that cities are fundamentally asymmetrical systems of resource extraction. The modern city maintains its dominance over the surrounding rural hinterland through established institutional, financial, and infrastructural networks that pump agricultural produce, raw materials, energy, and labour directly into the urban core (Cronon, 1991; Harvey, 1996)^[15, 27]. The military siege abruptly inverts this historical power dynamic. By deploying forces to cut these supply arteries, the besieging army lays bare the total material vulnerability of the urban environment once it is severed from its rural foundations.

When the Prussian army completed the blockade of Paris in mid-September 1870^[10], it isolated a metropolis of over two million residents that produced virtually none of its own basic food requirements (Tombs, 1999; Cogneau & Keszenbaum, 2021). Labouchere's letters vividly record how quickly Parisian self-assurance evaporated when cut off from provincial France. Deprived of the vast agricultural networks of the French countryside, the capital was reduced to a state of helpless dependency, pinning its desperate hopes on unconfirmed rumours that provincial relief armies (*Armées de la Loire*) were marching to break the Prussian lines (Labouchere, 1871)^[36]. The daily life of Paris shifted from a dynamic capital commanding a global empire to an isolated island frantically managing internal reserve stocks. In Peking, the 1900^[26] siege exposed the absolute fragility of Western imperial power in China when deprived of its technological networks. European, American, and Japanese diplomats, traders, and missionaries had long operated under the legal protection of extraterritoriality, enjoying luxurious lifestyles backed by steamship lines, gunboat diplomacy, and foreign-managed railways (Preston, 2000; Cohen, 1997)^[11]. However, when the Boxers severed the Tianjin-Peking railway line and destroyed the telegraph infrastructure, this global power network collapsed. The foreign elite found themselves barricaded within a tiny, three-quarter-square-mile enclave of the Legations Quarter, dependent on a few shallow water wells and stored grains, entirely unable to project authority beyond their defensive sandbags (Coltman, 1901)^[13].

In Leningrad, the metabolic rupture reached unparalleled scale and intensity. Following the capture of Shlisselburg by German forces on September 8, 1941^[2], all overland rail and road links connecting Leningrad to the broader Soviet hinterland were severed (Barber & Harrison, 2005; Salisbury, 1969)^[44, 45]. The city was starved of grain from the Ukraine and the North Caucasus, coal from the Donbas, and oil from the Caucasus. The structural vulnerability of the Soviet urban system was further magnified when early German air raids destroyed the Badayev warehouses, burning thousands of tons of centralized flour and sugar reserves (Reid, 2011).

Leningrad's survival depended entirely on the desperate establishment of a fragile, substitute metabolic conduit: the famous "Road of Life" (*Doroga Zhizni*) constructed across the frozen surface of Lake Ladoga during the winter months (Simmons & Perlina, 2005^[46]; Bidlack & Lomagin, 2012). Over this thin, exposed ice road, Soviet authorities attempted to haul minimal flour supplies into the city while

evacuating hundreds of thousands of sick and starving civilians. The sheer precariousness of the Lake Ladoga ice line underscored a fundamental law of urban systems: without a high-capacity, continuous link to an agricultural hinterland, a modern industrial metropolis rapidly collapses toward biological extinction.

3. The Alienation of Urban Authority and Political Disillusionment

The spatial and metabolic isolation caused by a siege inevitably induces intense political alienation among the trapped populace. As municipal authorities struggle to manage dwindling stockpiles, enforce strict rationing, and maintain public order, citizens frequently direct their anger, fear, and frustration at state officials and military commanders.

Throughout his correspondence, Henry Labouchere directed sharp criticism at the Provisional Government of National Defense, led by General Louis-Jules Trochu. Labouchere argued that the military leadership was paralysed by administrative incompetence, indecision, and fear of the radical Parisian working class (Labouchere, 1871; Horne, 1965)^[36, 53]. The government's secretiveness regarding remaining grain and livestock stockpiles fueled widespread public suspicion that elite merchants and state figures were hoarding food while working-class neighbourhoods faced famine. This deep breakdown in trust between the municipal government and the working-class *faubourgs* laid the social groundwork for the revolutionary explosion of the Paris Commune just weeks after the siege ended.

In Dr. Robert Coltman Jr.'s documentation of the Peking legations, a similar alienation emerges, directed both at the surrounding Qing government and at internal diplomatic leadership. Coltman expressed contempt for Western diplomats who had ignored repeated medical and intelligence warnings regarding the scale of the Boxer Uprising, leaving the civilian population vulnerable and ill-prepared (Coltman, 1901)^[13]. Once trapped, internal political frictions flared continuously between military officers, diplomatic ministers, and civilian volunteers over the allocation of defensive positions, medical supplies, and food rations.

In the Leningrad ego-documents compiled by Simmons and Perlina, political alienation was expressed under conditions of total police surveillance and severe ideological repression. In the secret diary of Liubov' Vasil'evna Shaporina, a cultured theatre artist living through the blockade, alienation from the Soviet political apparatus is starkly documented. Shaporina condemned Joseph Stalin and the top Party leadership for abandoning Leningrad to its fate, viewing the massive civilian body count as a direct result of totalitarian neglect, strategic blunder, and administrative callousness (Simmons & Perlina, 2005)^[46]. She observed with bitter indignation that while ordinary workers were dying of starvation in their unheated apartments, high-ranking Communist Party officials stationed at the Smolny Institute continued to receive comfortable food allocations (Simmons & Perlina, 2005^[46]; Kirschenbaum, 2006).

Burdens of Siege: Scarcity, Class Stratification, and Psychological Endurance

1. Class Stratification and the Political Economy of Caloric Deprivation

A central finding across all three historical case studies is that the burdens imposed by a siege are never distributed

equitably across the urban hierarchy. The sudden onset of material scarcity acts as a diagnostic lens, exaggerating existing class divisions, spatial inequalities, and social power asymmetries. The ability to survive metabolic rupture is heavily dictated by an individual's socioeconomic status, political access, gender, and age.

In the Siege of Paris, the initial reliance on free-market distribution mechanisms caused catastrophic price inflation that severely victimized the working-class population. While wealthy bourgeois residents in the central arrondissements could afford inflated prices for rare meats, preserved goods, and wine, the working-class residents of Belleville and Montmartre were rapidly reduced to starvation (Labouchere, 1871^[36]; Cogneau & Kesztenbaum, 2021). As standard butcher supplies failed, an informal market in alternative meats emerged. Labouchere detailed the progressive consumption of the city's working animal population such as horses, draft mules, and dogs. This was eventually followed by exotic zoo animals from the *Jardin des Plantes*, including camels, antelopes, and famously, the two elephants Castor and Pollux (Labouchere, 1871; Horne, 1965)^[36, 53].

When basic animal stocks were exhausted, sewer rats became a recognized commodity on working-class market stalls. Labouchere noted with characteristic irony that while wealthy diners at upscale boulevard restaurants could sample "salmis of rat" prepared with high-end culinary sauces, working-class families lacked even the basic wood or coal required to cook what little scrap meat they could scavenge.

In Peking, class, racial, and imperial hierarchies shaped the spatial distribution of risk and sustenance within the Legations Quarter. Dr. Robert Coltman Jr.'s narrative reveals that while foreign diplomats, military officers, and Western civilians were allocated primary living quarters, dedicated medical care, and regular meat portions from slaughtered legation horses, several thousand Chinese Christian converts (*coolies* and refugees) who had fled to the legations for protection were subjected to severe structural discrimination (Coltman, 1901; Hevia, 2003)^[13, 29]. These native Chinese refugees were deployed as hard manual labour, working under constant sniper fire to build sandbag barricades, dig trenches, and extinguish fires ignited by Boxer incendiary attacks. Despite performing the most dangerous physical labour necessary for the survival of the legations, they received significantly smaller food rations, leading to widespread malnutrition and disease outbreaks within their segregated quarter (Coltman, 1901)^[13].

In Leningrad, the structural distribution of caloric survival was explicitly managed by the Soviet state through a rigid, class- and labour-based rationing hierarchy. The state issued distinct ration cards (*kartochki*) that categorized the urban population into functional economic tiers:

- Category 1 (Industrial Workers and Engineers):** Received the highest caloric allocation (initially 500g of bread per day, dropped to 250g at the depth of the crisis in November 1941)^[2] because their labour directly supplied the Red Army front line (Simmons & Perlina, 2005^[46]; Bidlack & Lomagin, 2012).
- Category 2 (Non-manual Employees and Dependents):** Received significantly lower allocations (dropping to a starvation level of 125g of bread per

day—composed largely of inedible fillers, cellulose, and sawdust) (Reid, 2011).

3. **Children and the Elderly:** Assigned the lowest survival tier, resulting in astronomical mortality rates among elderly intellectuals, young children, and non-working dependents.

This state-administered caloric hierarchy created a grim landscape of biological survival. In the diaries collected by Simmons and Perlina, survivors describe the utter collapse of traditional social norms under the pressure of terminal hunger. Exhausted citizens collapsed and froze to death directly on the snow-covered sidewalks of Prospect 25 October (Nevsky Prospekt). The physical strength required to perform basic domestic and urban functions vanished. When a family member died inside an unheated apartment, surviving relatives frequently concealed the death for days or weeks, keeping the corpse in a cold room in order to continue claiming the deceased person's daily bread ration card (Simmons & Perlina, 2005; Salisbury, 1969) ^[44, 46]. Furthermore, the physical effort required to dig graves in the frozen Russian soil led to an economic extortion market, where gravediggers demanded exorbitant sums, valuable heirlooms, or precious bread rations to bury the dead (Simmons & Perlina, 2005) ^[46].

2. The Semiotics of Food and Biological Reductionism

Under conditions of acute metabolic rupture, the socio-cultural understanding of food undergoes a radical transformation. Food is stripped of its complex cultural, social, and aesthetic meanings such its role in hospitality, regional identity, and family ritual. Instead, it is reduced strictly to quantitative, biological metrics: grams, calories, and survival units.

This transformation in cognitive framing is explicitly recorded across the ego-documents. In normal urban life, individuals discuss food in terms of menus, flavours, dining settings, and social gatherings. Under siege, as Labouchere, Coltman, and the Leningrad diarists illustrate, written entries become obsessively mathematical. Diarists meticulously record exact weights, chemical compositions, and caloric trade-offs.

In *Writing the Siege of Leningrad*, multiple diarists record their bitter or bemused reactions to news arriving from the outside world. When reports reached Leningrad regarding Mahatma Gandhi's anti-colonial political hunger strikes in India, starving Leningraders expressed disbelief and sardonic amusement (Simmons & Perlina, 2005) ^[46]. To individuals enduring involuntary, systematic biological starvation on 125 grams of sawdust-adulterated bread per day amidst freezing sub-zero temperatures, the concept of a voluntary, politically staged hunger strike appeared as an incomprehensible, surreal performance from a distant world. Similarly, Henry Labouchere documented the surreal commercial survival of elite Parisian gastronomy during the 1870 ^[10] blockade. High-end restaurants continued to open their doors, serving multi-course meals where traditional beef, pork, and chicken were replaced by carefully seasoned horse flesh, cat stews, and rat terrines (Labouchere, 1871) ^[36]. The persistent use of sophisticated French culinary terminology to mask the consumption of urban vermin represented a desperate attempt by the Parisian bourgeoisie

to maintain their cultural identity even as their physical metabolism was reduced to basic animal survival.

3. The "Burden of Pretence" and Psychological Resistance

While metabolic rupture directly attacks the biological body, a siege simultaneously subjects the urban population to severe psychological decay, social atomization, and existential dread. To counter this psychological breakdown, besieged populations frequently invent coping mechanisms, engaging in what can be conceptualized as the "burden of pretence."

The "burden of pretence" refers to the deliberate performance of non-utilitarian, civil, cultural, or recreational activities that serve no direct physical or military purpose, but are performed specifically to preserve human dignity, cultural identity, and social structure against the entropy of war.

- **In Peking (1900)** ^[26]: While surrounded by Boxer forces and subject to daily artillery bombardment, trapped American and European residents insisted on organizing formal musical performances, holding structured religious services, and celebrating traditional national holidays. Dr. Robert Coltman Jr. records that on July 4, 1900, American citizens inside the besieged diplomatic compound gathered to celebrate Independence Day, raising the American flag, reciting patriotic speeches, and singing national anthems while under direct sniper fire (Coltman, 1901) ^[13]. Performing these rituals allowed the besieged community to reinforce their collective identity and mask their terror.
- **In Paris (1870–1871)** ^[1, 10]: Citizens organized public orchestral concerts, literary readings, and political club debates inside public halls, maintaining the vibrant intellectual culture of the city despite severe fuel shortages and Prussian artillery shelling (Labouchere, 1871 ^[36]; Horne, 1965).
- **In Leningrad (1941 ^[6]–1944)**: The performance of the "burden of pretence" reached extraordinary artistic and heroic heights. Despite high Stalinism's long-standing state policy of militant atheism, church attendance surged across Leningrad during the winter of 1941 ^[2]–1942, as starving citizens sought spiritual meaning, communal solidarity, and solace in traditional Orthodox liturgies (Simmons & Perlina, 2005 ^[46]; Kirschenbaum, 2006)

The most famous historical instantiation of this phenomenon occurred on August 9, 1942, with the Leningrad premiere of Dmitri Shostakovich's Symphony No. 7 ("Leningrad Symphony"). Organizers gathered surviving musicians from the Radio Orchestra—many of whom were so weakened by starvation that their hands trembled while holding their instruments—and reinforced them with military musicians pulled from the front line (Simmons & Perlina, 2005; Fay, 2000) ^[19, 46]. The concert was broadcast live via loudspeakers mounted throughout the city and transmitted across the German front lines. In the oral testimony of musician Kseniia Makianovna Matus, preserved in the Simmons and Perlina collection, performing this complex, intense symphony while suffering from advanced malnutrition was an act of civil self-defence (Simmons &

Perlina, 2005) ^[46]. By asserting that the city could still produce high musical culture amidst total metabolic enclosure, the inhabitants demonstrated that while the enemy could starve their physical bodies, it could not extinguish their urban identity.

Permanent Structural Transformations and Institutional Legacies

1. The Siege as a Critical Juncture in Urban History

A military siege is never merely a temporary interruption after which an urban system seamlessly returns to its pre-war state. Instead, a siege functions as a critical institutional juncture (Collier & Collier, 1991; Mahoney & Thelen, 2010) ^[12, 37], applying extreme pressure to a city's administrative, economic, spatial, and ideological structures. The operational workarounds, social revolutions, and security adaptations forged during the crucible of blockade frequently become permanent features of the post-war urban landscape.

2. Paris: The Crucible of the Commune and Radical European Politics

The lifting of the Siege of Paris on January 28, 1871 ^[1], following the capitulation of the French provisional government, immediately triggered a catastrophic political explosion. The four months of Prussian blockade had completely delegitimized the conservative political elite and radicalized the armed civilian *Garde Nationale*, particularly within working-class neighbourhoods (Tombs, 1999; Merriman, 2014).

When the national government led by Adolphe Thiers attempted to enter Paris on March 18, 1871 ^[1], to disarm the *Garde Nationale* by seizing their artillery cannons stationed at Montmartre, the working-class population revolted. The insurgents drove the state authorities out of the city to Versailles and proclaimed the Paris Commune, the world's first radical working-class municipal government (Tombs, 1999; Gluckstein, 2006) ^[24].

For 72 days, the Paris Commune transformed the administrative, social, and economic architecture of the city.

The Commune instituted radical policies

- Abolishing night work for bakeries,
- Suspending residential rent payments incurred during the Prussian siege
- Reorganising factories abandoned by fleeing owners into worker-managed cooperatives
- Separating church and state, and
- Transforming public space by demolishing symbols of imperial militarism such as the Vendôme Column (Tombs, 1999; Harvey, 2003) ^[28].

Although the Commune was violently suppressed during the "Bloody Week" (*Semaine sanglante*) in May 1871 ^[1]—resulting in the execution of an estimated 10,000 to 20,000 Communards by French government troops—the siege and its revolutionary aftermath permanently altered European political history. As radical theorists such as Mikhail Bakunin and Karl Marx observed, the Paris Commune demonstrated that the existing state machinery had to be radically transformed to serve an urban working class (Bakunin, 1871; Marx, 1871) ^[1, 38].

The spatial memories of the siege and the Commune redefined French politics for generations, leading to

enduring institutional changes in municipal policing, urban planning, and labour legislation across the Third Republic.

3. Peking: Imperial Collapse and the Demolition of Historic Spatial Enclosures

In China, the defeat of the Boxer Siege in August 1900 ^[26] by the Eight-Nation Alliance (*Ba Guo Lian Jun*) served as a decisive institutional catalyst that accelerated the final collapse of the Qing Dynasty. The total failure of Empress Dowager Cixi's policy of utilizing Boxer anti-foreign sentiment to expel Western powers resulted in the humiliating Boxer Protocol (*XinChou TiaoYue*) signed in September 1901 (Preston, 2000; Hevia, 2003) ^[29].

The Protocol imposed astronomical financial indemnities on the Qing court—requiring the payment of 450 million taels of silver over 39 years—which bankrupt the imperial treasury and forced the Chinese state to mortgage its maritime customs and salt revenues to foreign banks (Esherick, 1987 ^[18]; Bickers, 2011). Furthermore, the treaty mandated severe spatial and military transformations within Peking itself:

1. The Qing government was forced to permit foreign powers to permanently station military garrisons directly inside the diplomatic quarter.
2. The imperial state was compelled to completely demolish the strategic Dagou forts guarding the riverine approach from Tianjin to Peking (Preston, 2000).
3. The foreign powers constructed an expanded, heavily fortified Legation Quarter that was completely walled off from the surrounding Chinese population, creating an extraterritorial fortress within the heart of the imperial capital (Hevia, 2003) ^[29].

This total destruction of imperial sovereignty severely delegitimized the Qing Dynasty in the eyes of Chinese intellectuals, military officers, and radical nationalists. The financial exhaustion and political humiliation caused by the post-siege settlement directly laid the structural foundations for the Wuchang Uprising and the Xinhai Revolution of 1911, led by Sun Yat-sen, which abolished China's two-thousand-year-old imperial system and established the Republic of China (Esherick, 1987; Spence, 1990) ^[18, 47].

4. Leningrad: The Myth of the Unbroken City and Post-War Ideological Purges

The successful defence of Leningrad against Nazi encirclement became one of the most powerful foundational narratives of the post-war Soviet state. The survival of the city was officially commemorated as an unprecedented triumph of Soviet patriotism, Communist Party organization, and industrial working-class resilience (Kirschenbaum, 2006; Reid, 2011). However, the reality of post-siege Leningrad was characterized by deep institutional trauma and political suppression. The shared experience of surviving 900 days of absolute isolation had forged a distinct, highly cohesive civic identity among Leningrad's local Party leaders, intellectuals, and citizens—an independent political identity that Joseph Stalin viewed with intense paranoia (Barber & Harrison, 2005; Salisbury, 1969) ^[44].

Between 1949 and 1950, Stalin executed the "Leningrad Affair" (*Leningradskoye Delo*), a brutal political purge directed against the local Party leadership that had governed the city during the blockade, including figures such as Pyotr

Popkov and Aleksei Kuznetsov (Bidlack & Lomagin, 2012). Key leaders were arrested, tortured, executed, or exiled, and the short-lived Museum of the Defence of Leningrad was forcibly closed and its artifacts destroyed, because its exhibits highlighted civilian suffering, local self-reliance, and individual heroism rather than attributing all victory to Stalin’s central direction in Moscow (Kirschenbaum, 2006; Simmons & Perlina, 2005)^[46]. Despite this official political repression, the cultural memory of the blockade endured within the informal memory networks of the *blokadnitsy*. The Piskaryovskoye Memorial Cemetery thus symbolized the survivor identity, where hundreds of thousands of blockade victims lie in mass graves. The cemetery is, still to this day, considered an emotional foundation of the city’s modern socio-cultural character, persisting long after the collapse of the Soviet Union and the restoration of the city’s historical name, St. Petersburg.

Synthesis and Comparative Discussion

When viewed through the analytical lens of urban systems theory, the historical accounts of Paris, Peking, and Leningrad reveal a striking, underlying structural unity behind their disparate geographical, temporal, and ideological settings. Across all three cases, the military siege operates through a consistent

functional sequence:

- Spatial Enclosure:** The besieging force isolates the urban core from its regional and global hinterland networks, converting an open metabolic system into a closed, entropic space.
- Metabolic Rupture:** The sudden termination of vital inflows (food, fuel, water, information) forces the city to subsist entirely on dwindling internal stockpiles, triggering rapid hyper-inflation, market collapse, or strict administrative rationing.
- Internal Stratification:** Material scarcity exacerbates existing social hierarchies, redistributing biological risk onto marginalized classes, non-essential workers, and vulnerable populations.
- Psychological Adaptation:** The trapped population invents complex coping strategies, such as the "burden of pretence" in order to perform cultural normality and maintain social cohesion amidst extreme trauma.
- Institutional Transformation:** The siege acts as a critical institutional juncture, creating a structural vacuum that permanently reorganizes governance, political power, and urban space.

Table 1: The Cross-Case Comparative Matrix

Comparative Dimension	Paris (1870 ^[10] -71)	Peking (1900 ^[26] -01)	Leningrad (1941 ^[6] -44)
System Scale and Population	Entire capital (~2 million)	Enclosed diplomatic quarter (~4000)	Industrial capital (~2.5 to 3 million)
Nature of Disruption	Prussian military encirclement	Boxer and Qing Imperial troops perimeter attack	Nazi Germany/Finnish total blockade
Stratification and Class Dynamics	Bourgeois pricing vs Working class hunger	Foreign privilege vs Chinese coolie labour	State ration cards access, Party elites
Dominant Coping Mechanism	Public hall meetings, culinary pretences	Religious services, 4 th of July celebrations	Classical symphony, church attendance
Primary Critical Juncture Outcome	Outbreak of the radical Paris Commune	Collapse of the Imperial Qing state	Stalinist purges, enduring survivor identity

This article has examined the city under siege as a diagnostic stress test of the urban system. By deploying urban systems theory, urban political ecology, and historical institutionalism to analyse primary ego-documents from Paris (1870–1871), Peking (1900–1901), and Leningrad (1941^[1, 6, 10, 13, 26]–1944), this study demonstrates how total spatial enclosure and metabolic rupture dismantle the physical, economic, and socio-political architecture of urban life. The primary theoretical contribution of this study is its demonstration that a city’s viability is cannot be reduced its physical permanence understood as its infrastructure. Rather, the city is better understood through the continuous, delicate choreography of its metabolic flows. When a siege severs a city’s connections to its rural hinterland and broader trade networks, the illusion of urban autonomy vanishes. The modern metropolis is revealed as an open socio-ecological entity dependent on constant material exchange. Furthermore, this analysis shows that metabolic rupture is never an equal-opportunity disaster. Under the pressure of blockade, scarcity magnifies existing class, gender, and political divides, transforming food access into a weapon of survival or state control. Yet, even under the most brutal conditions of biological deprivation, human

populations consistently demonstrate extraordinary psychological resilience, utilizing cultural performances and the "burden of pretence" to defend their urban identity against total entropy. Finally, by framing sieges as critical junctures, this article underscores their enduring historical legacies. Whether catalysing the revolutionary working-class experiment of the Paris Commune, accelerating the collapse of China’s imperial dynasty, or forging an unbreakable civic identity in Leningrad, the crucible of the siege fundamentally rewrites the socio-political trajectories of cities and states. In a contemporary era characterized by expanding urban populations, hyper-complex supply chains, climate-induced infrastructure failures, and modern urban warfare, the lessons of the historical siege remain urgently relevant. The study of the city under siege serves as a stark reminder that beneath the gleaming facade of the modern urban system lies a highly vulnerable socio-metabolic web, especially one that requires continuous, peaceful, and cooperative flow to survive.

References

- Bakunin, M. The Paris Commune and the Idea of the State. New York: Vintage Books, 1871.

2. Barber, J., Harrison, M. *The Soviet Home Front, 1941–1945: A Social and Economic History of the USSR in World War II*. London: Longman, 2005.
3. Batty, M. *Cities and Complexity: Understanding Cities with Cellular Automata, Agent-Based Models, and Fractals*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2007.
4. Bettencourt, L. M. The origins of scaling in cities. *Science*, 2013;340(6139):1438–1441.
5. Bickers, R. *The Scramble for China: Foreign Devils in the Qing Empire, 1832–1914*. London: Allen Lane, 2011.
6. Bidlack, R., Lomagin, N. *The Leningrad Blockade, 1941–1944: A New History*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 2012.
7. Bradford, J. C. *International Encyclopedia of Military History*. London: Routledge, 2004.
8. Castells, M. *The Rise of the Network Society*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.
9. Childe, V. G. The urban revolution. *The Town Planning Review*, 1950;21(1):3–17.
10. Cogneau, D., Keszenbaum, L. The demographic impacts of the sieges of Paris, 1870–1871. *Population*, 2021;76(3):541–572.
11. Cohen, P. A. *History in Three Keys: The Boxers as Event, Experience, and Myth*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1997.
12. Collier, R. B., Collier, D. *Shaping the Political Arena: Critical Junctures, the Labor Movement, and Regime Dynamics in Latin America*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 1991.
13. Coltman, R., Jr. *Beleaguered in Peking: The Boxers' Siege between the Legations*. Philadelphia, PA: F. A. Davis Company Publishers, 1901.
14. Coward, M. *Urbicide: The Politics of Urban Destruction*. London: Routledge, 2009.
15. Cronon, W. *Nature's Metropolis: Chicago and the Great West*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1991.
16. Dekker, R. *Ego-Documents and History: Autobiographical Writing in Social History Since the Middle Ages*. Hilversum: Verloren, 2002.
17. Elden, S. Secure the volume: Vertical geopolitics and the depth of power. *Progress in Human Geography*, 2013;37(1):35–51.
18. Esherick, J. W. *The Origins of the Boxer Uprising*. Berkeley, CA: University of California Press, 1987.
19. Fay, L. E. *Shostakovich: A Life*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000.
20. Foster, J. B. Marx's theory of metabolic rift: Classical foundations for environmental sociology. *American Journal of Sociology*, 1999;105(2):366–405.
21. Fulbrook, M., Rublack, U. In relation: The 'social self' and ego-documents. *German History*, 2010;28(3):263–272.
22. Gandy, M. *Concrete and Clay: Rhythms of Urban Life in New York City*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 2002.
23. Glantz, D. M. *The Siege of Leningrad, 1941–1944: 900 Days of Terror*. Osceola, WI: MBI Publishing, 2001.
24. Gluckstein, D. *The Paris Commune: A Revolution in Action*. London: Bookmarks, 2006.
25. Graham, S. *Cities, War, and Terrorism: Towards an Urban Geopolitics*. Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishing, 2004.
26. Harrington, P. *Peking 1900: The Boxer Rebellion*. Oxford: Osprey Publishing, 2001.
27. Harvey, D. *Justice, Nature and the Geography of Difference*. Oxford: Blackwell, 1996.
28. Harvey, D. *Paris, Capital of Modernity*. London: Routledge, 2003.
29. Hevia, J. L. *English Lessons: The Pedagogy of Imperialism in Nineteenth-Century China*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 2003.
30. Heynen, N., Kaika, M., Swyngedouw, E. *In the Nature of Cities: Urban Political Ecology and the Politics of Urban Metabolism*. London: Routledge, 2006.
31. Horne, A. *The Fall of Paris: The Siege and the Commune 1870–71*. London: Macmillan, 1965.
32. Jacobs, J. *The Death and Life of Great American Cities*. New York: Random House, 1961.
33. Kaika, M. *City of Flows: Modernity, Nature, and the City*. London: Routledge, 2005.
34. Kennedy, C., Cuddihy, J., Engel-Yan, J. The metabolism of cities. *Journal of Industrial Ecology*, 2007;11(2):43–59.
35. Kirschenbaum, L. A. *The Legacy of the Siege of Leningrad, 1941–1995: Myth, Memories, and Monuments*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
36. Labouchere, H. *Diary of the Besieged Resident in Paris*. London: Hurst and Blackett Publishers, 1871.
37. Mahoney, J., Thelen, K. *Explaining Institutional Change: Ambiguity, Agency, and Power*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2010.
38. Marx, K. *The Civil War in France*. London: Edward Truelove, 1871.
39. Merriman, J. *Massacre: The Life and Death of the Paris Commune of 1871*. New York: Basic Books, 2014.
40. Moore, J. W. *Capitalism in the Web of Life: Ecology and the Accumulation of Capital*. London: Verso, 2015.
41. Mumford, L. *The City in History: Its Origins, Its Transformations, and Its Prospects*. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1961.
42. Preston, D. *The Boxer Rebellion: The Dramatic Story of China's War on Foreigners that Shook the World in the Summer of 1900*. New York: Walker & Company, 2000.
43. Reid, A. *Leningrad: The Epic Siege of World War II, 1941–1944*. New York: Walker & Company, 2011.
44. Salisbury, H. E. *The 900 Days: The Siege of Leningrad*. New York: Harper & Row, 1969.
45. Shaw, M. *The New Western Way of War: Risk-Transfer War and its Crisis in Iraq*. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2005.
46. Simmons, C., Perlina, N. *Writing the Siege of Leningrad: Historical Narratives, Oral Histories, and Diaries*. Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press, 2005.
47. Spence, J. D. *The Search for Modern China*. New York: W. W. Norton & Company, 1990.
48. Swyngedouw, E. The city as a hybrid: Freeing flow of water in the metropolis. *Kaos*, 1996;22:25–48.
49. Swyngedouw, E. Circulations and metabolisms: Hybrid natures and cyborg cities. *Science as Culture*, 2006;15(2):105–121.
50. Tombs, R. *The Paris Commune 1871*. London: Longman, 1999.
51. Weber, M. *The City*. Glencoe, IL: Free Press, 1958.
52. Wheatley, P. *The Pivot of the Four Quarters: A Preliminary Enquiry into the Origins and Character of the Ancient Chinese City*. Chicago, IL: Aldine Publishing Company, 1971.
53. Wolman, A. The metabolism of cities. *Scientific American*, 1965;213(3):179–190.